## SUPREME COURT OF ILLINOIS

## WEDNESDAY, SEPTEMBER 29, 2021

## THE FOLLOWING CASES ON THE LEAVE TO APPEAL DOCKET WERE DISPOSED OF AS INDICATED:

- 126057 Jamal Shehadeh, petitioner, v. Sheriff Michael Downey, respondent. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Third District. 3-17-0158 Petitioner having failed to file a Petition for Leave to Appeal within the time allowed by order, this case is Dismissed.
- People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Dmitry Kolesnikov, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Second District. 2-18-0787
   Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.

In the exercise of this Court's supervisory authority, the Appellate Court, Second District, is directed to vacate its judgment in <u>People v. Kolesnikov</u>, case No. 2-18-0787 (08/24/20). The appellate court is directed to consider the effect of the opinion of the United States Supreme Court in <u>Caniglia v.</u> <u>Strom</u>, 593 U.S. \_\_\_\_\_ (2021), on the issue of whether the police officers' entry into defendant's home was justified in accordance with the community-caretaking doctrine and determine if a different result is warranted.

- 126575 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Francisco Carrion, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-17-1001 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Lonnie B. Pritchard, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Second District. 2-19-0180 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- People State of Illinois, petitioner, v. Derrick D. Jenkins, respondent.
   Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Fourth District. 4-19-0878, 4-19-0908
   Petitioner having failed to file a Petition for Leave to Appeal within the time allowed by order, this case is Dismissed.

- People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Alvin Harris, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Fifth District. 5-18-0023
   Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 126980 Kandra Jones, petitioner, v. Illinois Human Rights Commission et al., respondents. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-20-1297 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- People State of Illinois, petitioner, v. Ronald E. Burt, respondent. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Second District. 2-18-0821 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.

Michael J. Burke, J. took no part.

- 127017 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Brian Gallas, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Second District. 2-19-0445
   Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- People State of Illinois, respondent, v. William K. Poor, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Fourth District. 4-18-0772 Petitioner having failed to file a Petition for Leave to Appeal within the time allowed by order, this case is Dismissed.
- People State of Illinois, petitioner, v. Rex Frank, respondent. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Third District. 3-18-0159
   Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127032 People State of Illinois, petitioner, v. David L. Bronson, respondent. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Fourth District. 4-19-0164 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127037 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Abdullah Aljohani, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-19-0692 Petition for Leave to Appeal Allowed.
- People State of Illinois, petitioner, v. Prince Johnson, respondent. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-16-1666 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.

- 127042 People State of Illinois, petitioner, v. Tyrone Pearson, respondent. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Second District. 2-19-0833 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127051 People State of Illinois, petitioner, v. Tavon Ludy, respondent. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Fifth District. 5-16-0523
   Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127093 People State of Illinois, petitioner, v. Darren D. Brown, respondent. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Third District. 3-17-0621 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.

Chief Justice Anne M. Burke, C.J., joined by Neville, J., dissenting from the court's denial of the petition for leave to appeal. Dissent attached.

Carter, J. took no part.

127109 - Michael A. Applegate, petitioner, v. Illinois Human Rights Commission et al., respondents. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-19-1419

- 127119 People State of Illinois, petitioner, v. Dion Addison, respondent. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Second District. 2-18-0545
   Petition for Leave to Appeal Allowed.
- People State of Illinois, petitioner, v. Kyran M. Williams, respondent. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Second District. 2-18-0736 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127129 Camille Mayfield Cooper Brotze et al., petitioners, v. The City of Carlinville, Illinois, etc., et al., respondents. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Fourth District. 4-20-0369, 4-20-0383, 4-20-0384 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Cornelius Freeman, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Fourth District. 4-19-0486 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.

127131 - Thomas J. Frederick, respondent, v. Terry L. Gaca et al., etc., petitioners. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Third District. 3-20-0154 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.

Carter, J. took no part.

- 127132 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Mario Rocha, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-19-1714
   Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Bobby Lee Archie, petitioner.
   Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Third District. 3-18-0595
   Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127134 Donna K. Godair, petitioner, v. The Metro East Sanitary District, respondent. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Fifth District. 5-20-0160 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127135 Helene Tonique Williams, petitioner, v. The Human Rights Commission et al., respondents. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-20-0785

Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.

127137 - Marvin O'Neal, petitioner, v. The Illinois Human Rights Commission et al., respondents. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-20-0772

- 127138 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. William B. Horman, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Third District. 3-19-0382 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- Prate Roofing and Installations, LLC, respondent, v. Liberty Mutual Insurance Corporation, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-19-1842
   Petition for Leave to Appeal Allowed.
- 127141 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Marquad Harris, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Fifth District. 5-16-0454 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.

- 127142 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Jermalle Brown, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-19-0705 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127143 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. John K. Williamson, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Fourth District. 4-19-0458 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127144 People State of Illinois, petitioner, v. Michael R. Howard, respondent. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Third District. 3-18-0441 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127145 People State of Illinois, petitioner, v. Stephen P. Sweigart, respondent. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Second District. 2-18-0543 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127146 David Souza et al., etc., petitioners, v. The City of West Chicago et al., respondents. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Second District. 2-20-0047
   Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127147 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Seth A. Dryer, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Second District. 2-19-0187
   Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- The State of Illinois ex rel. Matthew Hurst et al., petitioners, v. Fanatics, Inc., et al., respondents. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-19-2159

Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.

Anne M. Burke, C.J. took no part.

- 127149 Brian J. Strauss, Indv., etc., petitioner, v. The City of Chicago, etc., respondent. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-19-1977 Petition for Leave to Appeal Allowed.
- People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Curtis T. Hairston, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Fourth District. 4-19-0326 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.

 127151 - People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Timothy Tolbert, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-18-0117 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.

Neville, J. took no part.

- 127152 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Cecil Ross, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-18-0559
   Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127153 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Edna G. Bell, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Fifth District. 5-18-0007
   Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127154 Illinois Federation of Public Employees Local 4408, petitioner, v. Andrew Lopinot, etc., et al., respondents. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Fifth District. 5-20-0083 Petition for Appeal as a Matter of Right or, in the alternative, Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127155 John Aaberg, respondent, v. James Aaberg, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Fourth District. 4-20-0439 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127157 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Eva R. Morris, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Third District. 3-17-0816
   Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127158 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. James L. Roberts Jr., petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Third District. 3-19-0442 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.

Carter, J. took no part.

 127161 - P. Andre Katz, Indv., etc., respondent, v. Michael Hartz et al., petitioners. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-20-0331 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.

- 127162 Ian H. Fisher, Esq., petitioner, v. The Office of the Illinois Attorney General, etc., respondent. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-20-0225
   Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127163 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Timothy Jones, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-16-3430
   Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127164 Nicholas Cuda et al., petitioners, v. Jeffrey H. Bunn et al., respondents. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-20-0520 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- Hartford Fire Insurance Company, etc., et al., respondents, v. Adobo Limited Partnership, etc., et al. (Averus, Inc., petitioner). Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-19-2422 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127166 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. George L.R. Powell, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Fourth District. 4-20-0327 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127168 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Willie Booker, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Second District. 2-20-0144 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127169 People State of Illinois, petitioner, v. Angela J. Wells, respondent. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Third District. 3-18-0344 Petition for Leave to Appeal Allowed.

Carter, J. took no part.

127170 - Robert Antonson, petitioner, v. The Department of Human Services et al., respondents. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-19-2272
 Potition for Leave to Appeal Depied

Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.

 127172 - People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Katherine O'Malley, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Fifth District. 5-19-0127 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.

- 127174 MHM Correctional Services, Inc., et al., respondents, v. Evanston Insurance Company, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-20-0552
   Petitioner having failed to file a Petition for Leave to Appeal within the time allowed by order, this case is Dismissed.
- 127176 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Levelle Henry, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-17-1373 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127177 Walworth Investments-LG, LLC, respondent, v. Mu Sigma, Inc., et al., petitioners. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-19-1937 Petition for Leave to Appeal Allowed.
- 127179 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Tristan Scaggs, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-17-3017
   Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- People State of Illinois, respondent, v. James R. Williams, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Second District. 2-19-0276 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127181 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. James Gibson, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-19-0137
   Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127182 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Cassidy L. Cheek, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Second District. 2-20-0281 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127183 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Terrell Patton, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-17-1895 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127184 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Mario Ortega, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-17-2007 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.

127185	-	People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Ricardo Jaimes, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Second District. 2-19-0241 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.

- 127187 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Miguel Vazquez, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-19-0437 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127188 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Dwayne B. Hollins, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Fourth District. 4-19-0145 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127189 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Reynaldo Cruz, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-19-1711
   Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- Joshua Murphy v. Jessica Wells et al. (Kenneth Wells & Sons LLC, respondent, v. Blackburn and Green, petitioner). Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Fourth District. 4-20-0385
   Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127192 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Kenyon Jones, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-17-1623
   Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127193 Alma Lasers, Inc., respondent, v. Yigazu Isthetics, Inc., petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-19-1894 Petition for Leave to Appeal or, in the alternative, Petition for Appeal as a Matter of Right Denied.
- 127194 RTC Industries, Inc., respondent, v. Makray Manufacturing Company, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-20-0496 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127195 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Dominiq Greer, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-19-1238
   Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.

- People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Timothy Fountain, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-17-2681 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127197 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Derrick Williams, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-18-1265 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- In re Marriage of Sandra J. Garza, respondent, and Robert D. Garza, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Third District. 3-19-0540 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.

Carter, J. took no part.

- People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Dywon Sheppard, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-18-1613 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Gregory A. Rollins, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Second District. 2-18-1040 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127204 Christine Ghostanyans et al., etc., petitioners, v. Pamela Goodwin, M.D., et al., respondents. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-19-2125 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127205 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Heriberto Viramontes, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-19-0665 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127207 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Reginald Owens, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-18-2160 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Michael Smith, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-17-1211
   Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.

- People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Anthony Smith, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-18-1178
   Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127211 Jonathan Cantrell, Adm'r, etc., petitioner, v. Wesley J. Borden, respondent. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Fifth District. 5-21-0051 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127212 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Akeem Simmons, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-18-1351 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127213 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Michael Hall, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Fourth District. 4-19-0001, 4-19-0002 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127214 RCB Equities #3, LLC, etc., respondent, v. Conrad Jakubow, etc., petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-20-0256 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127215 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Clifford W. Baker, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Fifth District. 5-18-0058 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127217 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Desmond Young, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-18-1962 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127218 Truck Insurance Exchange et al., etc., respondents, v. Roger A. D'Orazio, Jr., petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Third District. 3-19-0253 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Kevin Hall, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-17-0671
   Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Brandon Conway, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-19-0951
   Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.

- People State of Illinois, petitioner, v. Michael B. Pinkett, respondent. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Fourth District. 4-19-0172 Petition for Leave to Appeal Allowed.
- People State of Illinois, respondent, v. James Williams, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-19-0747 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- State of Illinois ex rel. John Thulis et al., petitioners, v. City of Chicago (Kwame Raoul, Attorney General of the State of Illinois, respondent). Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-19-1675 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- Midwest Mailing & Shipping Systems, Inc., etc., v. Schoenberg, Finkel, Newman & Rosenberg, LLC, etc., et al., petitioners (Ryan Rappa et al., respondents). Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-20-0669
   Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Bobby E. Wright Jr., petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Fourth District. 4-18-0630 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127229 Charles Green, petitioner, v. The Chicago Police Department, respondent. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-20-0574 Petition for Leave to Appeal Allowed.
- People State of Illinois, petitioner, v. Germal L. Banta, respondent. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Fourth District. 4-18-0761 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Delvin Jackson, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-17-0764
   Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- Joel M. Cahn, petitioner, v. The City of Highland Park et al., respondents. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Second District. 2-19-1092

- 127233 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Eric Kent Glover, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Third District. 3-18-0152 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127234 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Anthony Gavin, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-18-2085
   Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.

- People State of Illinois, respondent, v. James Lewis, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-19-0494
   Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127236 Javier Robinson, respondent, v. The Village of Sauk Village et al., petitioners. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-20-0223 Petition for Leave to Appeal Allowed.
- 127237 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Drew Terrell, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-18-1224 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.

Theis, J. took no part.

- 127238 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Samuel Span, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Second District. 2-18-0966 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Mark Howard, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-19-0417
   Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- People State of Illinois, petitioner, v. John Prante, respondent. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Fifth District. 5-20-0074
   Petition for Leave to Appeal Allowed.

127246 - Freeburg Community Consolidated School District No. 70, etc., et al., petitioners, v. Country Mutual Insurance Company, etc., et al. (RSUI Indemnity Company, respondent). Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Fifth District. 5-19-0098
 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.

relition for Leave to Appear Deni

Overstreet, J. took no part.

 Darin Whitten et al., petitioners, v. Rochester Township Republican Central Committee et al., etc., respondents. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Fourth District. 4-21-0181 Petition for Appeal as a Matter of Right or, in the alternative,

Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.

- 127248 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Helene Tonique Williams, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-20-1275 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127250 In re Estate of Donna R. Cuesta, etc. (Suzan G. Held, petitioner, v. Ruben M. Garcia, respondent). Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-20-0945
   Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- Michael W. Underwood et al., etc., petitioners, v. City of Chicago, etc., et al., respondents. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-21-0227

Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.

Anne M. Burke, C.J. took no part. Neville, J. took no part.

- People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Ezyekeio M. Sidney, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Third District. 3-19-0048
   Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- Byron Sigcho-Lopez, petitioner, v. The Illinois State Board of Elections et al., respondents. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-20-0561

Petition for Leave to Appeal Allowed.

Anne M. Burke, C.J. took no part. Theis, J. took no part.

- 127254 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. John C. Martin, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Fifth District. 5-18-0379
   Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127255 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Jeffery D. Merriweather, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Second District. 2-19-0144 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127256 People State of Illinois, petitioner, v. Brandon Jackson, respondent. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-18-0672 Petition for Leave to Appeal Allowed.
- McHenry Township, respondent, v. The County of McHenry et al., etc., petitioners. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Second District. 2-20-0478

Petition for Leave to Appeal Allowed.

- 127259 Timothy Leadley et al., petitioners, v. Darrell E. Jones, respondent. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Fifth District. 5-19-0239 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127261 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Darren Wilson, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-19-1928
   Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127262 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Nathan Nissenbaum, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-19-1143 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- Bill A. Busbice, Jr., etc., et al., petitioners, v. Trountman Sanders, LLP, et al., etc., respondents. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-20-0848
   Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- People State of Illinois, petitioner, v. Leamon R. Cavitt Jr., respondent.
   Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Second District. 2-17-0149
   Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.

Michael J. Burke, J. took no part.

- 127265 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Javonta T. Pitts, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Fifth District. 5-17-0283 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127266 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Blake E. Mariani, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Fourth District. 4-19-0417 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127267 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Omar Almanza, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Third District. 3-19-0228
   Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127268 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Ronnie Lance, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-18-1665
   Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127271 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Marvin Higgs, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-19-1620 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127272 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Johnny R. Priester, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Fourth District. 4-18-0644 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Robert M. Clark, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Third District. 3-18-0610 Petition for Leave to Appeal Allowed.
- People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Cole Huber, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Fourth District. 4-19-0447
   Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127276 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Samantha L. Molnar, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Second District. 2-19-0289 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127277 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Marshaun Boykin, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-19-0703 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.

- 127278 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Juan Torres, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-17-2057
   Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Willie J. Hall, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Fourth District. 4-18-0790
   Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Willie Morrison, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-17-2626, 1-18-0612 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127281 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Marcus Jackson, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-17-2316 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127282 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Robert Quillman, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Fourth District. 4-18-0618 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Jeryme Morgan, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-17-1331
   Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127284 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Charles Wilks, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-18-2168
   Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127285 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Micah Mannie, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-16-2510
   Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127287 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Dujuan Powe, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-17-3059
   Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127288 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Joseph F. McCloud, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Third District. 3-18-0241 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.

- People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Wilbur Driver, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-18-1813
   Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Laron Thomas, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-17-3000
   Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Marlon Coleman, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Third District. 3-19-0060 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.

Carter, J. took no part.

- People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Earl Truss, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-18-1600
   Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127293 Christine Dema, petitioner, v. Corine O'Hara et al., respondents. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-20-1003 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Michael D. Norsworthy, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Second District. 2-19-0349
   Detition for Leave to Appeal Depied

- 127295 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Ronald Turner, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-19-1613
   Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Jamie Lloyd, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-18-1273
   Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Joseph Yntema, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Third District. 3-19-0613 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.

127299 - U.S. Bank National Association, respondent, v. Lioubov Popvytch, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-20-0541 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.

Overstreet, J. took no part.

127300 - People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Pedro A. Ramos, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Third District. 3-19-0441 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.

Carter, J. took no part.

- 127301 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Ariel Gomez, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-19-2020 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Kenny Pugh, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-18-1981
   Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127303 Balitha Greenfield et al., petitioners, v. Vanessa Munoz, respondent. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-20-0875 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Frank Thomas, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-19-0332
   Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Scott Stoutenborough, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Fourth District. 4-18-0809 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127307 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Stanley Boclair, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Fourth District. 4-18-0813 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127308 Ibrahim Mustafaa, petitioner, v. Illinois Department of Healthcare and Family Services et al., etc., respondents. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-19-0744 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.

- People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Vernon Tolbert, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-18-1654 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- Arthur Strong, petitioner, v. Board of Trustees of the North Chicago Police Pension Fund et al., etc., respondents. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Second District. 2-20-0417 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127311 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Vernon Tolbert, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-18-1923 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127312 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Dwight Coverson, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-17-2833 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127313 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Brian Kobiela, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Fourth District. 4-19-0260
   Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127314 The City of West Chicago, etc., petitioner, v. Virginia R. Pietrobon, etc., et al., respondents. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Second District.
   2-20-0174
   Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127315 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. George White, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Second District. 2-17-0643 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127316 Michelle Wolff, etc., petitioner, v. Bethany North Suburban Group, etc., respondent. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-19-1858 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127317 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Shamar McGee, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-19-0192 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.

- People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Juan Villareal, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-18-1817
   Petition for Leave to Appeal Allowed.
- 127320 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Mario Lawrence, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-17-1399 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.

- 127321 Dana K. Foulks, Indv., etc., petitioner, v. Community Unit School District 428 et al., respondents. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Second District. 2-20-0461
   Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Reginald Potts, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-16-1219
   Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.

Neville, J. took no part.

- 127323 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Daniel B. Pederson, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Second District. 2-18-0554 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127324 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Demonta Bolden, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-17-1479 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- Midwest Sanitary Service, Inc., et al., respondents, v. Sandberg, Phoenix & Von Gontard, P.C., et al., petitioners. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Fifth District. 5-19-0360 Petition for Leave to Appeal Allowed.

Overstreet, J. took no part.

127328 - George Hirmiz, petitioner, v. Illinois Commerce Commission et al., respondents. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-20-0870 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.

- 127329 The Village of Wilmette, respondent, v. 1618 Sheridan Road Condo Association, respondent (Marshall Spiegel et al., etc., petitioners). Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-19-0264 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127330 Shana Kridner, etc., et al., petitioners, v. Austin Hough, respondent. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Fourth District. 4-20-0453 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127331 Door Properties, LLC, respondent, v. Ayad M. Nahlawi, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-18-2568 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Austin M. Mitchener, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Third District. 3-18-0581 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Orville Miller, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-19-0397
   Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.

Theis, J. took no part.

- People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Jaytwon M. Mobley, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Fourth District. 4-20-0277 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127335 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Mohamed Nakhleh, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-19-0505 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127336 Katherine Thiel, Indv., etc., v. Maris Construction Corporation, respondent (G.W. Thiel, Inc., petitioner). Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-21-0255 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127337 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Charles Ratzke, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Second District. 2-19-0786 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.

- People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Arthur M. Unger, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Third District. 3-18-0696 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Montrell D. Cooper, petitioner.
   Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Fifth District. 5-18-0225
   Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127341 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Anna L. Mueller, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Second District. 2-19-0868 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Kenyatta Brown, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-19-2572 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.

 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Shawn T. Block, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Third District. 3-18-0240 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.

Carter, J. took no part.

- 127345 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Michael Minnifield, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-19-0126 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127346 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Joseph A. Leckner, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Fifth District. 5-18-0494 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127347 Christopher Manders et al., petitioners, v. Carol Joanne Gorman, respondent. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Third District. 3-18-0494, 3-18-0679
   Petition for Leave to Appeal or in the alternative. Petition for

Petition for Leave to Appeal or, in the alternative, Petition for Appeal as a Matter of Right Denied.

 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. James E. Hudson, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-19-2594 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.

Neville, J. took no part.

- 127349 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Donchii Malone, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-16-3006 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Alfredo Soto, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Second District. 2-18-0925
   Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127352 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Sakhee Hardy Johnson, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-18-0112 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127353 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Kevin F. Graf, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Second District. 2-20-0406 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127355 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Scott G. Sheldon, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Third District. 3-18-0641 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.

Chief Justice Anne M. Burke, C.J., joined by Neville, J., dissenting from the court's denial of the petition for leave to appeal. Dissent attached.

Carter, J. took no part.

- 127357 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Jaquan S. Anderson, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Second District. 2-19-1001 Petition for Appeal as a Matter of Right or, in the alternative, Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127358 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Wesley R. Carey, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Fourth District. 4-19-0097 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.

127359	-	People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Deangelo Bivens, petitioner.
		Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-17-2080
		Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.

- People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Markus A. Hubbell, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Second District. 2-19-0442 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127362 The City of Effingham, Illinois, etc., respondent, v. Village Square Mall Realty Management LLC, etc., et al. (Durga Property Holdings, LLC, petitioner). Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Fifth District. 5-20-0431 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127363 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Diwone A. Wallace, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Fifth District. 5-19-0030 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Kyle A. Delhaye, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Second District. 2-19-0271 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127365 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Jerichoe Hines, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-19-1378
   Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- Sunnybrook, LP, respondent, v. The City of Alton, Illinois, etc., petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Fifth District. 5-19-0314 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.

Overstreet, J. took no part.

Fitzgerald Mullins et al., petitioners, v. Timothy C. Evans, Indv., etc., et al., respondents. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-19-1962

127368 - People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Edwin Martinez, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-17-1533 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.

Anne M. Burke, C.J. took no part.

- 127370 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Michael Caraway, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-18-0556 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127371 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Sherrieann Remsik-Miller, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Second District. 2-18-1045 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127372 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Allan Kustok, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-19-1899
   Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127373 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Steven Anderson, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-19-2606 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127374 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Lavonte Moore, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-18-0653
   Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127375 In re Commitment of Daniel McCormack (People State of Illinois, petitioner, v. Daniel McCormack, respondent). Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-18-1930
   Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.

Anne M. Burke, C.J. took no part.

- 127376 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Roberto Cerda, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-17-1433
   Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127377 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Robert Stivers, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Fifth District. 5-18-0338
   Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.

127380	-	People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Kevin Robinson, petitioner.
		Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-19-2289
		Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.

- 127382 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Jose Martinez, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-19-0408
   Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127384 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Dominique Parkman, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-18-0510 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- Morris Engineering, Inc., petitioner, v. New Lenox Development, LLC, etc., et al., respondents. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Third District. 3-19-0532
   Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127388 Bruning & Associates, P.C., respondent, v. Michael Eversman, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Second District. 2-20-0502 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127389 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Gerald Rufus, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-18-2048
   Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127390 In re Estate of Mary V. Linder, Deceased (David W. Linder, petitioner, v. Millikin University et al., etc., respondents). Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Third District. 3-20-0039
   Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.

Carter, J. took no part.

- People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Alberto Ruiz, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-19-1701
   Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127394 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Charles Bruce Thomas, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Fifth District. 5-17-0244 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.

- People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Ival E. Miles, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Second District. 2-19-0620
   Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127397 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Juan Alvarado-Gonzalez, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-18-1209 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- People State of Illinois, petitioner, v. Kevin Dugar, respondent. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-18-2545
   Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.

- People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Michael T. McNeely, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Fourth District. 4-19-0418 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Marshall Baker, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-17-1204
   Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.

In the exercise of this Court's supervisory authority, the Appellate Court, First District, is directed to vacate its judgment in <u>People v. Baker</u>, case No. 1-17-1204 (05/13/21). The appellate court is directed to address on the merits defendant's argument that the admission of evidence that defendant had previously committed the offenses of home invasion and attempted criminal sexual assault against M.M. for any relevant purpose, including propensity, as provided by section 115-7.3(b) of the Code of Criminal Procedure (725 ILCS 5/115-7.3(b)), was plain error, and determine if a different result is warranted.

- People State of Illinois, respondent, v. William D. Jenkins, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Fourth District. 4-18-0794 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127402 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Angelo Graham, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-19-0253 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.

- 127403 The Newport Condominium Association, petitioner, v. Blackhall Corporation 401(K) PSP et al., etc., respondents. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-20-0847 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127405 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. James Edward Williams, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Second District. 2-18-0276 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127408 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Donald L. Emery, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Fourth District. 4-19-0484 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- State of Illinois ex rel. Clinton Krislov, petitioner, v. BMO Harris Bank, N.A., et al., respondents. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-19-2273 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127410 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Roger W. Carroll Jr., petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Fourth District. 4-20-0491 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127411 Marc Norfleet, petitioner, v. Frank Lawrence, etc., respondent. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Fifth District. 5-20-0293 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127412 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Germel Dossie, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-20-1050
   Petition for Leave to Appeal Allowed.
- 127413 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Pierre Montanez, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-19-1065 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127414 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Bernard Gully, Jr., petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Third District. 3-20-0357 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.

- 127415 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Michael F. Anderson, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Second District. 2-19-0128 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127416 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Abdoula Jimerson, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-19-0585 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127417 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Vernon Tolbert, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-18-2390
   Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Ahmad Simms, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-16-1067
   Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127419 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Edward Bodnar, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Third District. 3-21-0215 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127420 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Johnny L. Warren, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Fifth District. 5-19-0495 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127421 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Jesus Bermudez, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Second District. 2-20-0111 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127423 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Dewallis Harris, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-18-1349 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127424 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Spencer Jackson, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-19-0406 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.

 In re Marriage of Colleen Kent and Luis Cortez, respondent (Douglas P. Trent, petitioner). Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Second District. 2-20-0637

Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.

- People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Andrew Coe, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Fourth District. 4-20-0233
   Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127427 Wells Fargo Bank, N.A., respondent, v. John S. Coghlan, etc., et al., petitioners. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Third District. 3-19-0701 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.

Carter, J. took no part.

- People State of Illinois, respondent, v. William Lange, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Second District. 2-20-0045
   Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127429 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Marlon Boyce, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-19-0589
   Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Marci M. Webber, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Second District. 2-19-1090 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Rickie T. Nichols, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Second District. 2-19-0659 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Patrick McGovern, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-18-2331
   Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127435 Terry Bovee, petitioner, v. Cheryl Bovee et al., respondents. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Fifth District. 5-20-0193 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.

- 127436 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Christopher L. Sanders, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Third District. 3-19-0728 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127437 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Jose Rivera, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-19-2227 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Maurice Jones, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Second District. 2-18-0794 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127439 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Walid Rahmouni, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-19-1319 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127442 Darryl Brown, petitioner, v. Board of Education of the City of Chicago et al., respondents. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-20-0727
   Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Demetrius Johnson, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-20-0912 Petition for Leave to Appeal Allowed.
- People State of Illinois, respondent, v. William Gregory Snow, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Third District. 3-19-0051 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127445 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Yolanda Neely, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-19-2060 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127446 American Guardian Funding Corp. et al., respondents, v. Kamkad Automotive Holdings, LLC, et al. (Chester K. Owens, petitioner). Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Second District. 2-21-0214 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.

- 127447 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. LaTodd Ezell Williams, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Third District. 3-20-0135 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127448 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Michael Sims, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-17-2580 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- Deanna D. Williams, etc., respondent, v. Rockford Health Physicians et al., petitioners. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Second District. 2-20-0353
   Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127450 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Lawrence Boyd, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-18-2584 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127452 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Jesse Alvarez, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Second District. 2-18-0947
   Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127453 Theophilus llevbare, petitioner, v. Department of Children and Family Services, respondent. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-20-0907

Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.

 People ex rel. Kwame Raoul, etc., petitioner, v. The Illinois Commerce Commission et al., respondents. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-20-0366
 Petitioner having failed to file a Petition for Leave to Appeal within the time allowed by order, this case is Dismissed.

Anne M. Burke, C.J. took no part.

127455 - People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Charles C. Blair, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Second District. 2-19-0866 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.

- 127456 J&B Signs, Inc., et al., petitioners, v. Commonwealth Edison Company, respondent. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-20-1005 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127457 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Norris Boston, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-18-1822
   Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127458 Chicago Title Land Trust Company, etc., petitioner, v. Village of Bolingbrook, respondent. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Third District. 3-19-0564 Petition for Leave to Appeal Allowed.
- 127460 Robert Antonson, petitioner, v. Illinois Department of Human Services, et al., etc., respondents. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-20-0583

Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.

- 127461 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Shalimar Santiago, petitioner. Leave to Appeal Appellate Court, First District. 1-18-2548 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- People State of Illinois, respondent, v. John Shores, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-20-0133
   Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127465 Copper Bend Pharmacy, Inc., etc., et al., respondents, v. OptumRx, Inc., etc., petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Fifth District. 5-21-0083

- 127466 Frederich Gopez, petitioner, v. City of Chicago, respondent. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-19-2611 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127467 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Douglas Livingston, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-18-0701 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.

- People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Micah J. Hopkins, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Fourth District. 4-20-0124 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127469 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Stephan A. Russell, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Second District. 2-18-0874 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127470 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Tyrone Gabb, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-19-1138 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127471 Radarsat Media, Inc., petitioner, v. Taty Development, Inc., et al., respondents. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-20-0774 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127473 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Jeffrey Grafton, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-20-1047
   Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127474 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Matthew Carmichael, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-17-3031 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.

- 127475 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Mario Ortega, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-18-2396
   Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127476 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Aaron Payne, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-18-1614
   Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127477 William Matthiessen, Special Adm'r, etc., petitioner, v. Greenwood Motor Lines, Inc., etc., et al., respondents. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-20-0405 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.

- 127478 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. LB Joseph, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-17-0741 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127479 Marlyn Nutraceuticals, respondent, v. ZAC Packaging, LLC, et al., petitioners. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-20-0326 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127481 Marc Kramer, etc., petitioner, v. Gabriel Ruiz, respondent. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Fifth District. 5-20-0026 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127482 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Edward L. McLaurin, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Third District. 3-18-0122 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127483 Uncle Tom's, Inc., etc., petitioner, v. Lynn Plaza, LLC, respondent. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-20-0205 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Antoine Reynolds, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-19-0590 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127485 Richard Talerico, respondent, v. The Village of Clarendon Hills, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Second District. 2-20-0318 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Aloysius Oliver, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-18-1605
   Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.

In re Estate of Doris Westphal, etc. (Scott Westphal et al., respondents, v. Pamela Nestel, petitioner). Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Second District. 2-19-0324, 2-19-0775
 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127490 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Brodrick Griffith, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-19-0255 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Thomas A. Benavidez, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Second District. 2-19-0603 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Ruben Sanchez, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-19-0562 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Tyree Brannon, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-18-0066
  Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127497 Steve Qualizza, respondent, v. Fischer Fine Home Building, Inc., etc., petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-20-1242 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127498 Chicago Sun-Times, petitioner, v. The Chicago Transit Authority, respondent. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-19-2028 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- Mark Doyle, petitioner, v. The Executive Ethics Commission et al., etc., respondents. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Second District. 2-20-0157
  Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Brandon D. Owens, petitioner.
  Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Fourth District. 4-19-0656
  Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127501 Anthony Powell, petitioner, v. The City of Chicago, respondent. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-19-2145
  Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Willie Polk, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-18-1938
  Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.

127503	-	People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Angelo Cobbins, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-18-1660 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
127505	-	People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Darron Brewer, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-18-2638 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
127506	-	In re Marriage of Davin T. Power, petitioner, and Danielle Ethier, respondent. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-19-2345, 1-20-0723 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
127507	-	People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Cesar Becerra, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-18-2722 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
127508	-	People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Joseph S. Johnson, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Fourth District. 4-19-0446 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
127509	-	Talmitch Jackson et al., etc., petitioners, v. Callan Publishing Inc., etc., et al., respondents. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1- 19-1458 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
127511	-	Adam Holm et al., petitioners, v. Peter Kodat et al., respondents. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Third District. 3-20-0164 Petition for Leave to Appeal Allowed.
127512	-	Barry Ring, petitioner, v. Richard Schencker, Indv., etc., respondent. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-18-0909 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
127514	-	People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Julius O. Scott, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Fourth District. 4-19-0538 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.

- 127515 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Leondo Joseph, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-17-1026 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- Sunnyside Elgin Apartments, LLC, et al., respondents, v. Glenda Miller, etc., respondent. (The Board of Education of Riley Community Consolidated School District No. 18, petitioner). Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Second District. 2-20-0614 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127519 Chicago Sun-Times, respondent, v. Cook County Health and Hospital System, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-19-2551

Petition for Leave to Appeal Allowed.

- People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Travion Lockett, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-19-0007 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127523 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Donald McDonald, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-19-0687 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.

Anne M. Burke, C.J. took no part.

- People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Javon Evans, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-19-0336
  Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127526 Carol Cleeton, etc., petitioner, v. SIU Healthcare, Inc., et al. (Stephanie Whooley et al., respondents). Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Fourth District. 4-20-0490 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127527 John O'Connell, respondent, v. The County of Cook, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-20-1031
  Petition for Leave to Appeal Allowed.

- 127529 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Cordelrow Brown, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-19-0519 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127531 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Clifton Carter, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-19-1390
  Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127532 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Melvin L. Purnell, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Fourth District. 4-18-0054 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Michael Suggs, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-18-2243
  Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127534 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Andre G. Jones, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Second District. 2-19-0601 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.
- 127535 People State of Illinois, petitioner, v. James A. Pacheco, respondent. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, Third District. 3-15-0880 Petition for Leave to Appeal Allowed.
- 127536 People State of Illinois, respondent, v. Kendall Roberson, petitioner. Leave to appeal, Appellate Court, First District. 1-18-1726 Petition for Leave to Appeal Denied.

# IN THE

### **SUPREME COURT**

#### OF

# THE STATE OF ILLINOIS

(Docket No. 127093)

THE PEOPLE OF THE STATE OF ILLINOIS, Appellant, v. DARREN D. BROWN, Appellee.

Filed September 29, 2021.

CHIEF JUSTICE ANNE M. BURKE, dissenting from denial of the petition for leave to appeal:

¶1 The order entered in this matter states that the petition for leave to appeal is "denied." From this, one would assume that a majority of this court has concluded that the petition does not meet the criteria for discretionary review under Illinois Supreme Court Rule 315 (eff. Oct. 1, 2019) and has, therefore, voted to deny the petition. However, this is not the case. In fact, there is no majority vote: three justices have voted to deny the petition, three justices have voted to allow, and one justice is not participating.

The court makes no attempt to explain why, in the absence of four concurring votes to deny, a denial order is appropriate. Nor does the court explain why it is

¶2



SEP 29 2021

SUPREME COURT CLERK appropriate to issue an order that does not accurately set forth the votes of the court. This silence is not surprising; there is no justification for the court's disposition. And this is particularly true when one considers the history of this court's treatment of matters that fail to receive a majority vote.

¶ 3 Prior to 1975, it appears this court did not have a formal policy or procedure that allowed for the disposition of a full court matter when there was no majority vote. As Justice Klucynski explained in testimony before the Greenberg Commission in 1969,<sup>1</sup> it was the practice of the Court when there was no majority vote to simply "'hold[] the tie until a judge change[d] his vote and there [was] a decision.' "Kenneth A. Manaster, *Illinois Justice: The Scandal of 1969 and the Rise of John Paul Stevens* 151 (2001).

This changed, however, with this court's opinion in *Perlman v. First National Bank of Chicago*, 60 Ill. 2d 529 (1975) (*per curiam*). In that case, two justices had recused themselves, and the remaining justices lacked four concurring votes regarding the proper judgment to render in the opinion. *Id.* at 529. It was thus not possible to obtain the concurrence of four votes necessary for a decision as required under the Illinois Constitution (Ill. Const. 1970, art. VI, § 3). *Perlman*, 60 Ill. 2d at 529.

Over a dissent from Chief Justice Underwood, the court first rejected (without discussion) the option of appointing a replacement justice to hear the case and break the tie. *Id.* at 529-30; see *id.* at 531-32 (Underwood, C.J., dissenting). Instead, the court chose to embrace the policy followed by the United States Supreme Court, which, briefly stated, is to take no affirmative action when there is no majority vote. *Id.* at 529-30 (majority opinion); see, *e.g.*, *Durant v. Essex Co.*, 74 U.S. 107, 110 (1868) ("It has long been the doctrine in this country and in England, where courts consist of several members, that no affirmative action can be had in a cause where

¶ 5

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> The Greenberg Commission was convened by this court to investigate allegations of wrongdoing against Chief Justice Solfisburg and Justice Klingbiel. See Report of Special Commission of the Supreme Court of Illinois, *In re Special Commission in Relation to No. 39797 (People of the State of Illinois, Appellant, v. Theodore J. Isaacs et al., Appellees)*, No. 39797 (Ill. July 31, 1969), https://press-pubs.uchicago.edu/manaster/commissionreport.html, [https://perma.cc/D9GK-Z2XQ].

the judges are equally divided in opinion as to the judgment to be rendered or order to be made."); see generally Edward A. Hartnett, *Ties in the Supreme Court of the United States*, 44 Wm. & Mary L. Rev. 643, 646 (2002).

¶ 6 Perlman did depart from Supreme Court practice in one respect, however. When the Supreme Court issues an opinion in a case with evenly divided votes, the judgment line will state that the lower court has been "affirmed by an equally divided Court." See, e.g., Washington v. United States, 584 U.S. \_\_\_\_, \_\_\_, 138 S. Ct. 1832, 1833 (2018) (per curiam). The legal effect of this affirmance, however, is the same as if the appeal were dismissed. Neil v. Biggers, 409 U.S. 188 (1972). Since the legal effect of an affirmance by an equally divided court is a dismissal, this court in Perlman chose simply to state on the judgment line that the appeal was dismissed. Perlman, 60 III. 2d at 530.

¶ 7 Since 1975, this court has continued to follow the practice established in *Perlman*. When there is no majority vote in a case under advisement, a *per curiam* opinion is issued which explains that one or more of the justices are recused and that the remaining justices are divided, and the appeal is then dismissed without decision. The most recent *Perlman* opinion was issued in *In re J.M.A.*, 2021 IL 125680 (*per curiam*).

Importantly, the procedure adopted by the court in *Perlman* has not been limited solely to opinions. For example, in the most recent motion heard by the full court that failed to achieve a majority vote, the following order was entered, consistent with *Perlman*:

"Motion by Movants for a supervisory order.

¶ 8

In this case, two Justices of this Court have recused themselves and the remaining members of the Court are divided so that it is not possible to secure the constitutionally required concurrence of four judges for a decision (III. Const. 1970, art. IV, sec. 3). Accordingly, the motion for supervisory order is

dismissed." *Chicago Public Media, Inc. v. Gaughan*, No. 123880 (Ill. Sept. 12, 2018).<sup>2</sup>

Similarly, the most recent petition for rehearing that failed to achieve a majority vote was also dismissed using the *Perlman* procedure:

"In this case, one Justice of this court has recused himself, and the remaining members of the court are divided so that it is not possible to secure the constitutionally required concurrence of four judges for a decision (see III. Const. 1970, art. VI, § 3). Accordingly, the petition for rehearing is dismissed." *Chultem v. Ticor Title Insurance Co.*, No. 120448 (III. Sept. 25, 2017).

10 The *Perlman* procedure has even been applied to petitions for leave to appeal. In *PHL, Inc. v. Pullman Bank & Trust Co.*, 181 Ill. 2d 575 (1998), the following order was entered:

"In this case, two Justices of this Court have recused themselves and the remaining members of the Court are divided so that it is not possible to secure the constitutionally required concurrence of four judges for a decision (III. Const.1970, art. IV, sec.3). Accordingly, the petition for leave to appeal is dismissed."

¶ 11 Notably, following the entry of this order, the court denied a motion to vacate the dismissal order and reconsider the petition for leave to appeal. In two concurring opinions and a dissent, the court again discussed and rejected the option of appointing a replacement justice to break the tie. Instead, the court elected to resolve petitions for leave to appeal that fail to receive a majority vote by "continu[ing] to adhere to the procedure followed in *Perlman*." *PHL, Inc. v. Pullman Bank & Trust Co.*, 181 Ill. 2d 593, 594 (1999) (Miller, J., concurring, joined by Freeman C.J., and Bilandic, J.).

¶ 10

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup>Like petitions for leave to appeal, motions that are heard by the full court are subject to the constitutional rule that four concurring votes are necessary for a decision. *Jackson v. Board of Election Commissioners*, 2012 IL 111928, ¶21.

- ¶ 12 Despite the foregoing, and despite the fact that an established practice for addressing petitions for leave to appeal that fail to receive a majority vote was already in place, at some point in time this court began to treat petitions for leave to appeal differently. Instead of following the *Perlman* procedure, petitions for leave to appeal without a majority vote were simply denied, with no indication given in the denial order that the court's votes were evenly divided. The court has never explained why this change was made or even acknowledged to the public that it was being done.
- I have brought this problem to the court's attention on several occasions, repeatedly noting that a straight denial order in this situation is highly misleading since such an order indicates to the public that there were four votes to deny the petition when, in fact, there were not. Nevertheless, the court has persisted in this practice. See *People v. Lee*, No. 124719 (Ill. Sept. 25, 2019) (denial order) (Burke, J., dissenting); *Continental Casualty Co. v. Hennessy Industries, Inc.*, No. 124835 (Ill. Sept. 25, 2019) (denial order) (Burke, J., dissenting); *Continental Casualty Co. v. Hennessy Industries, Inc.*, No. 124835 (Ill. Sept. 25, 2019) (denial order) (Burke, J., dissenting); *People v. Ford*, No. 124583 (Ill. May 22, 2019) (denial order) (Burke, J., dissenting); *People v. Rodriguez*, No. 124715 (Ill. May 22, 2019) (Burke, J., dissenting); *People v. Perkins*, No. 123555 (Ill. Sept. 26, 2018) (denial order) (Burke, J., dissenting); *Johnson v. Pneumo Abex LLC*, No. 123820 (Ill. Sept. 26, 2018) (denial order) (Burke, J., dissenting); *Johnson v. Pneumo Abex LLC*, No. 123820 (Ill. Sept. 26, 2018) (denial order) (Burke, J., dissenting).
- ¶ 14 The parties and the public have a right to be given accurate information about the cases before this court. By entering a denial order when there are not, in fact, four concurring votes to deny, this court's order is saying something that simply is not true. It is both confounding and disappointing that, with full knowledge of what it is doing, the court continues to mislead the public.
- ¶ 15 There is no reason not to apply the *Perlman* procedure to petitions for leave to appeal. Other full court matters continued to be resolved using that framework, and it has been applied to petitions for leave to appeal in the past. Because the court does not apply the *Perlman* procedure here, I dissent.
- ¶ 16 JUSTICE NEVILLE joins in this dissent.

## IN THE

# **SUPREME COURT**

#### OF

## THE STATE OF ILLINOIS

(Docket No. 127355)

THE PEOPLE OF THE STATE OF ILLINOIS, Appellee, v. SCOTT G. SHELDON, Appellant.

Filed September 29, 2021.

CHIEF JUSTICE ANNE M. BURKE, dissenting from denial of the petition for leave to appeal:

¶ 1 The order entered in this matter states that the petition for leave to appeal is "denied." From this, one would assume that a majority of this court has concluded that the petition does not meet the criteria for discretionary review under Illinois Supreme Court Rule 315 (eff. Oct. 1, 2019) and has, therefore, voted to deny the petition. However, this is not the case. In fact, there is no majority vote: three justices have voted to deny the petition, three justices have voted to allow, and one justice is not participating.

¶2

The court makes no attempt to explain why, in the absence of four concurring votes to deny, a denial order is appropriate. Nor does the court explain why it is

FILED

SUPREME COURT CLERK

SEP 29 2021

appropriate to issue an order that does not accurately describe the votes of the court. This silence is not surprising; there is no justification for the court's disposition. And this is particularly true when one considers the history of this court's treatment of matters that fail to receive a majority vote.

¶ 3 Prior to 1975, it appears this court did not have a formal policy or procedure that allowed for the disposition of a full court matter when there was no majority vote. As Justice Klucynski explained in testimony before the Greenberg Commission in 1969,<sup>1</sup> it was the practice of the Court when there was no majority vote to simply "'hold[] the tie until a judge change[d] his vote and there [was] a decision.' " Kenneth A. Manaster, *Illinois Justice: The Scandal of 1969 and the Rise of John Paul Stevens* 151 (2001).

¶ 4 This changed, however, with this court's opinion in *Perlman v. First National Bank of Chicago*, 60 III. 2d 529 (1975) (*per curiam*). In that case, two justices had recused themselves, and the remaining justices lacked four concurring votes regarding the proper judgment to render in the opinion. *Id.* at 529. It was thus not possible to obtain the concurrence of four votes necessary for a decision as required under the Illinois Constitution (Ill. Const. 1970, art. VI, § 3). *Perlman*, 60 Ill. 2d at 529.

Over a dissent from Chief Justice Underwood, the court first rejected (without discussion) the option of appointing a replacement justice to hear the case and break the tie. *Id.* at 529-30; see *id.* at 531-32 (Underwood, C.J., dissenting). Instead, the court chose to embrace the policy followed by the United States Supreme Court, which, briefly stated, is to take no affirmative action when there is no majority vote. *Id.* at 529-30 (majority opinion); see, *e.g.*, *Durant v. Essex Company*, 74 U.S. 107, 110 (1868) ("It has long been the doctrine in this country and in England, where courts consist of several members, that no affirmative action can be had in a cause where the judges are equally divided in opinion as to the judgment to be rendered

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> The Greenberg Commission was convened by this court to investigate allegations of wrongdoing against Chief Justice Solfisburg and Justice Klingbiel. See Report of Special Commission of the Supreme Court of Illinois, *In re Special Commission in Relation to No. 39797 (People of the State of Illinois, Appellant, v. Theodore J. Isaacs et al., Appellees)*, No. 39797 (Ill. July 31, 1969), https://press-pubs.uchicago.edu/manaster/commissionreport.html, [https://perma.cc/D9GK-Z2XQ].

or order to be made."); see generally Edward A. Hartnett, *Ties in the Supreme Court* of the United States, 44 Wm. & Mary L. Rev. 643, 646 (2002).

¶ 6 Perlman did depart from Supreme Court practice in one respect, however. When the Supreme Court issues an opinion in a case with evenly divided votes, the judgment line will state that the lower court has been "affirmed by an equally divided Court." See, e.g., Washington v. United States, 584 U.S. \_\_\_\_, \_\_\_, 138 S. Ct. 1832, 1833 (2018) (per curiam). The legal effect of this affirmance, however, is the same as if the appeal were dismissed. Neil v. Biggers, 409 U.S. 188 (1972). Since the legal effect of an affirmance by an equally divided court is a dismissal, this court in Perlman chose simply to state on the judgment line that the appeal was dismissed. Perlman, 60 III. 2d at 530.

¶ 7 Since 1975, this court has continued to follow the practice established in *Perlman*. When there is no majority vote in a case under advisement, a *per curiam* opinion is issued, which explains that one or more of the justices are recused and that the remaining justices are divided, and the appeal is then dismissed without decision. The most recent *Perlman* opinion was issued in *In re J.M.A.*, 2021 IL 125680 (*per curiam*).

Importantly, the procedure adopted by the court in *Perlman* has not been limited solely to opinions. For example, in the most recent motion heard by the full court that failed to achieve a majority vote, the following order was entered, consistent with *Perlman*:

"Motion by Movants for a supervisory order.

¶ 8

In this case, two Justices of this Court have recused themselves and the remaining members of the Court are divided so that it is not possible to secure the constitutionally required concurrence of four judges for a decision (III. Const. 1970, art. IV, sec. 3). Accordingly, the motion for supervisory order is dismissed." *Chicago Public Media, Inc. v. Gaughan*, No. 123880 (III. Sep. 12, 2018).<sup>2</sup>

- 3 -

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup>Like petitions for leave to appeal, motions that are heard by the full court are subject to the constitutional rule that four concurring votes are necessary for a decision. *Jackson v. Board of Election Commissioners*, 2012 IL 111928, ¶ 21.

Similarly, the most recent petition for rehearing that failed to achieve a majority vote was also dismissed using the *Perlman* procedure:

"In this case, one Justice of this court has recused himself, and the remaining members of the court are divided so that it is not possible to secure the constitutionally required concurrence of four judges for a decision (see III. Const. 1970, art. VI, § 3). Accordingly, the petition for rehearing is dismissed." *Chultem v. Ticor Title Insurance Company*, No. 120448 (III. Sept. 25, 2017).

The *Perlman* procedure has even been applied to petitions for leave to appeal. In *PHL, Inc. v. Pullman Bank & Trust Co.*, 181 Ill. 2d 575 (1998), the following order was entered:

"In this case, two Justices of this Court have recused themselves and the remaining members of the Court are divided so that it is not possible to secure the constitutionally required concurrence of four judges for a decision (III. Const.1970, art. IV, sec.3). Accordingly, the petition for leave to appeal is dismissed."

¶ 11 Notably, following the entry of this order, the court denied a motion to vacate the dismissal order and reconsider the petition for leave to appeal. In two concurring opinions and a dissent, the court again discussed and rejected the option of appointing a replacement justice to break the tie. Instead, the court elected to resolve petitions for leave to appeal that fail to receive a majority vote by "continu[ing] to adhere to the procedure followed in *Perlman*." *PHL, Inc. v. Pullman Bank & Trust Company*, 181 Ill. 2d 593, 594 (1999) (Miller, J., concurring, joined by Freeman C.J., and Bilandic, J.).

¶ 12 Despite the foregoing, and despite the fact that an established practice for addressing petitions for leave to appeal that fail to receive a majority vote was already in place, at some point in time this court began to treat petitions for leave to appeal differently. Instead of following the *Perlman* procedure, petitions for leave to appeal without a majority vote were simply denied, with no indication given in the denial order that the court's votes were evenly divided. The court has

¶ 10

never explained why this change was made or even acknowledged to the public that it was being done.

- I have brought this problem to the court's attention on several occasions, repeatedly noting that a straight denial order in this situation is highly misleading since such an order indicates to the public that there were four votes to deny the petition when, in fact, there were not. Nevertheless, the court has persisted in this practice. See *People v. Lee*, No. 124719 (Ill. Sept. 25, 2019) (denial order) (Burke, J., dissenting); *Continental Casualty Co. v. Hennessy Industries, Inc.*, No. 124835 (Ill. Sept. 25, 2019) (denial order) (Burke, J., dissenting); *Continental Casualty Co. v. Hennessy Industries, Inc.*, No. 124835 (Ill. Sept. 25, 2019) (denial order) (Burke, J., dissenting); *People v. Ford*, No. 124583 (Ill. May 22, 2019) (denial order) (Burke, J., dissenting); *People v. Rodriguez*, No. 124715 (Ill. May 22, 2019) (Burke, J., dissenting); *People v. Perkins*, No. 123555 (Ill. Sept. 26, 2018) (denial order) (Burke, J., dissenting); *Johnson v. Pneumo Abex, LLC*, No. 123820 (Ill. Sept. 26, 2018) (denial order) (Burke, J., dissenting); *Johnson v. Pneumo Abex, LLC*, No. 123820 (Ill. Sept. 26, 2018) (denial order) (Burke, J., dissenting).
- ¶ 14 The parties and the public have a right to be given accurate information about the cases before this court. By entering a denial order when there are not, in fact, four concurring votes to deny, this court's order is saying something that simply is not true. It is both confounding and disappointing that, with full knowledge of what it is doing, the court continues to mislead the public.
- ¶ 15 There is no reason not to apply the *Perlman* procedure to petitions for leave to appeal. Other full court matters continued to be resolved using that framework, and it has been applied to petitions for leave to appeal in the past. Because the court does not apply the *Perlman* procedure here, I dissent.
- ¶ 16 JUSTICE NEVILLE joins in this dissent.